

## 2020 Extraordinary Half Dime Sealed Bid Auction

### W. David Perkins, Numismatist

Welcome to the 2020 Extraordinary Capped Bust Half Dime Sealed Bid Auction! We hope you enjoy reading and studying this catalog as much as we enjoyed crafting it.

Nearly all of these half dimes are from the Stephen A. Crain collection. This is “Part Two” of our sale of the Crain collection, which contained all 92 die marriages and nearly every known die remarriage (lacking just three strong R-7 remarriages). Steve assembled his collection over the course of three-plus decades. His preferred grade and “look” was a lustrous and toned AU58. Steve would bypass mint state coins in order to achieve his AU58 goal. As much as Steve enjoyed the coins themselves, nobody who ever met him would believe for one second that he didn’t enjoy the history of the US Mint, studying the processes used in making coins, and camaraderie with fellow collectors even more. How many of us would seek the opinion of *Mr. Half Dime* when we thought we found something unique, or at least interesting, just to get his input? In almost 40 contributions to the John Reich Journal and untold numbers of contributions in other formats (such as the Collectors Universe and other online forums), the world got to know and recognize Steve as **The Expert** on nearly *All Things Half Dime*!

Proceeds from this sale, just like the proceeds from last year’s sale, will help the family pay for medical and assisted living facility charges incurred during the last years of Steve’s life.

The next page of this catalog contains a list of the coins available with lot numbers, attribution, rarity rating, grade, certification number, and special details, such as die stage or provenance. The number in parenthesis is the certification number on the label. The source of most Capped Bust Half Dime rarity ratings is the most recent JRCS census, published in the John Reich Journal in 2019. Ensuing pages contain color images and detailed descriptions of each coin.



**Proud Dad and His Children: Steve, Geoff, Ethan, Brad, Michelle (Bouley), and Justin**

**2020 Extraordinary Half Dime Sealed Bid Auction**  
**W. David Perkins, Numismatist**

Lot SX-01: 1829 LM-6.2, R-5. PCGS AU50 CAC ex-Meaney (12841796)

Lot SC-02: 1829 LM-15.1, R-4. PCGS AU58 (37054976)

Lot SC-03: 1829 LM-18, R-4. PCGS AU58 (37054975)

Lot SC-04: 1830 LM-5, R-6. PCGS VF30 (39096585)

Lot SC-05: 1831 LM-2, R-3. PCGS XF45 Retained Cud (37054985)

Lot SC-06: 1831 LM-2, R-3. PCGS AU55 Retained Cud (37264625)

Lot SC-07: 1832 LM-9.1, R-6. PCGS AU50 Ex-Logan/Bricker/Peterson (37055001)

Lot SC-08: 1832 LM-11.2, R-5. PCGS AU53 Ex-Logan (37054995)

Lot SC-09: 1833 LM-4.3, R-6. PCGS AU50 Retained “Internal Cud” (37054786)

Lot SC-10: 1833 LM-6, R-6. PCGS AU58 Retained “Internal Cud” (38727420)

Lot SC-11: 1836 LM-1.1, R-5. PCGS AU58 (37055009)

Lot SC-12: 1836 LM-1.2, R-4. PCGS AU53 Double Cud ex-Mark Smith (37054804)



**1829 LM-6.2 PCGS AU50 CAC**

**Lot SC-01: 1829 LM-6.2, R-5. PCGS AU50 CAC ex-Meaney (12841796).** The 1829 LM-6.1 and 6.2 remarriages have proven VERY difficult to locate for even the most persistent collectors. Just seven 1829 LM-6.2 half dimes were reported in the 2019 JRCS census of capped bust half dimes. Attribution of this particular remarriage is straightforward. After identifying the die marriage as 1829 LM-6, once looks for the tiny “cud” in the dentils above the M in AMERICA. If the tiny cud is present and the upper loop of S2 is not filled, the 6.2 remarriage is confirmed. An attractive coin with color, luster, and reflectivity. The consignor (not a Crain coin) called this coin an “AU54.” Richard Meaney bought this coin from Jack Beymer in an NGC AU55 holder, crossed it to PCGS to get the attribution on the label, and years later traded it to the consignor. An unattributed PCGS AU58 example of this remarriage sold for \$4,080 in October 2019 at a Heritage auction!



**1829 LM-15.1 PCGS AU58**

**Lot SC-02: 1829 LM-15.1, R-4. PCGS AU58 (37054976).** Other than noting that he purchased the coin in December of 2002, Steve didn’t provide us with much information on the history or significance of this half dime. What we can tell you is that two collectors reported owning MS61-graded examples of this scarce remarriage in the 2019 JRCS Census and we had sold a PCGS MS63 example of this remarriage in 2014 for more than \$3900 ... so this 1829 LM-15.1 is among finest known and desirable as such. Toning is an even brown, with some metallic green and copper highlights throughout. Luster is readily evident on both obverse and reverse as one would expect of a choice AU coin.





**1829 LM-18 PCGS AU58**

**Lot SC-03: 1829 LM-18, R-4. PCGS AU58 (37054975).** Steve had this in his collection since 1996, when he cracked it out of a PCGS AU58 rattler holder (insert included for winning bidder). Twenty-four years ago, he noted it was among the finest examples of the die marriage known ...and that assessment is still true to this day! Exhibiting excellent luster and vibrant gold color, we believe nearly every collector will see this as an upgrade. Evidently, this half dime saw so little circulation that the vertical die crack across Miss Liberty's face is easily viewed. Recall that it was Steve who made the decision, based on data and input from others, that this die marriage should be considered R-4, instead of the R-5 rating it has in the Logan-McCloskey half dime text.



**1830 LM-5 PCGS VF30**

**Lot SC-04: 1830 LM-5, R-6. PCGS VF30 (39096585).** The distribution of this rare die marriage appears to be about half found with the obverse cud and half found without the obverse cud, such as this example. Many collectors try to obtain an early die state AND a late die state example for a "complete set" by die marriage and die state. Although only six examples were reported in the 2019 JRCS census (this coin would have placed 4<sup>th</sup> in the census), we know there are more in collections that went unreported. Still thought of as a choice cherry-pick by collectors when they scour store inventory, auction sites, and ebay, this should be a popular item in this sale, even though it is not from the Crain collection. An even coin grey, the surfaces of this coin should appeal to collectors who demand originality. We sold a PCGS VF25 via auction for \$4662 in 2015.



**1831 LM-2 PCGS XF45 Retained Cud**

**Lot SC-05: 1831 LM-2, R-3. PCGS XF45 Retained Cud (37054985).** Collectors who specialize in late die states and cuds will want to take a look at this coin and the next coin in this sealed bid sale. While not a rare cud, many find this one a hard one to pass up when they find an example in a coin store, at auction, or otherwise “in the wild.” We call this a retained cud, because we can see the slightest dentil and lettering detail inside the area of the cud. We might call this late die state, not very late die state, since this die marriage is known with a full cud. Steve added this coin to his collection in 1997. Maybe you might bid on this one, the next one, or perhaps both?



**1831 LM-2 PCGS AU55 Retained Cud**

**Lot SC-06: 1831 LM-2, R-3. PCGS AU55 Retained Cud (37264625).** A choice AU example of the same die marriage as the prior lot, this half dime is an earlier die state. One does not need close study to determine that this is a retained cud, as dentils are easily seen “through” the cud. The luster is muted by darker grey toning. Note the strike difference between this coin and the previous lot. This 1831 LM-2 demonstrates a sharper strike, both obverse and reverse. Steve collected cuds whenever he found them, so it was common for him to have multiple duplicates of die states.





**1832 LM-9.1 PCGS AU50**

**Lot SC-07: 1832 LM-9.1, R-6. PCGS AU50 Ex-Logan/Bricker/Peterson (37055001).** When Steve acquired this coin, he noted the provenance as “Don Frederick, Alan Bricker, Russ Logan, and evidently for a very short time, Glenn Peterson.” Although this die remarriage has been reduced from R-7 to R-6 rarity estimate, this coin represents an excellent opportunity for most collectors who are attempting to put together a complete set by die marriage and remarriage. A lovely coin grey half dime with hints of copper evident when tilting the coin under a light.



**1832 LM-11.2 PCGS AU53**

**Lot SC-08: 1832 LM-11.2, R-5. PCGS AU53 Ex-Logan (37054995).** When we saw the date on which Steve obtained this coin (May 29, 2006) and that Steve’s notes said it was “Ex-Logan,” we had a hunch that he bought the coin from the Russell J. Logan Duplicate Sale, conducted by Brad Karoleff. Our hunch proved to be correct. This coin was lot #60 in the sale and described by Karoleff as follows, “Silver grey color over lightly lustrous surfaces with a few light hairlines ...a relatively pleasing example of this rare die marriage.” This coin comes with the green PCGS AU53 label from when Logan owned the coin.



**1833 LM-4.3 PCGS AU50**

**Lot SC-09: 1833 LM-4.3, R-6. PCGS AU50 Retained “Internal Cud” (37054786).** We recently sold a PCGS XF45 example of this remarriage with a retained cud, though we think the one we sold was a bit later die state. That coin realized more than \$3,100 in August of 2018. Steve’s coin sports a variety of patina, from rose to gold to green to copper, though some may find it darker than they prefer. When Steve obtained this coin in October of 2009, he noted, “Very nice example of retained cud (best seen), with attractive green/gold toning and much luster within letters.”



**1833 LM-6, R-6. PCGS AU58**

**Lot SC-10: 1833 LM-6, R-6. PCGS AU58 Retained “Internal Cud” (38727420).** Steve purchased this coin at the ANA Summer Show in 2004. He noted on his coin flip that there was a lump or internal cud where CA in AMERICA join. This coin would rank third in the JRCS census for this rare die marriage, with just an MS63 and MS61 grading higher. Moderate grey toning is seen on the coin’s central devices with luster evident toward the periphery. Luster is a challenge on this die marriage, at least in our experience, even with lightly-circulated coins. Not so with this one! We believe the collector who purchases this coin will be pleased with the flash evident in the less-toned areas.





**1836 LM-1.1 PCGS AU58**

**Lot SC-11: 1836 LM-1.1, R-5. PCGS AU58 (37055009).** For many casual and specialist collectors of capped bust half dimes, this will be the highlight of the sale. Steve obtained this coin in October of 1996 and unsurprisingly never found a better example in the following 2+ decades! There was just one finer example (MS63) reported in the most recent JRCS census, so nearly EVERY collector could benefit from owning this coin. The photo is spot-on for this coin. The luster really pops when viewed in hand. We expect some “major collectors” to be in on this 1836 LM-1.1 half dime. We do find it odd that there are many high-grade examples of the 1836 LM-1.2 remarriage, with coins in the MS64 to MS66 range obtainable. With this earlier die marriage, such is not the case. This coin is likely the most desirable R-5 in this sealed bid sale.





**1836 LM-1.2 PCGS AU53**

**Lot SC-12: 1836 LM-1.2, R-4. PCGS AU53 Double Retained Cud ex-Mark Smith (37054804).** A subset of Steve’s “addiction” to half dimes and die states was his love for this particular remarriage. Steve could not resist buying any 1836 LM-1.2 he happened upon. He would joke among fellow collectors that he was “working on a roll” of these! Mark Smith obtained this coin from a Heritage auction at the ANA sale in 1993 (lot #8457, according to Steve’s notes). The story of how Steve obtained this particular coin from Mark Smith is an interesting, yet sad, one. Steve wrote, “*Traded 1835 V8 [LM-2] EF-45 even with Mark Smith. Trade took place at time of Mark's death; his father had to send me the '36 V5b - the last transaction Mark ever made.*” Many of you will instantly recognize Mark Smith as the author that Logan and McCloskey “gained, then lost” during the production of the half dime book. Logan and McCloskey stated that Mark Smith’s reed-counting emission order techniques were paramount to solving one of the authors’ greatest mysteries. Knowing Steve Crain as we do, we firmly believe that Steve likely promised himself (in 1996, when he obtained this coin) to never sell this coin due to his fondness for Mark Smith. Steve kept that promise. There are higher-grade examples of this remarriage in many collections. We think few, if any, of these higher-grade coins have as interesting a story as this coin does.